## ABOUT THE FEDERALIST SOCIETY

The Federalist Society for Law and Public Policy Studies is an organization of 40,000 lawyers, law students, scholars and other individuals located in every state and law school in the nation who are interested in the current state of the legal order. The Federalist Society takes no position on particular legal or public policy questions, but is founded on the principles that the state exists to preserve freedom, that the separation of governmental powers is central to our constitution and that it is emphatically the province and duty of the judiciary to say what the law is, not what it should be.

The Federalist Society takes seriously its responsibility as a non-partisan institution engaged in fostering a serious dialogue about legal issues in the public square. We occasionally produce "white papers" on timely and contentious issues in the legal or public policy world, in an effort to widen understanding of the facts and principles involved and to continue that dialogue.

For more information about the Federalist Society, please visit our website: www. fed-soc.org.

# Guide to Judicial Selection in State High Courts 



## Table of Contents

Judicial Elections .....  4
Democratic Appointment ..... 6
Hybrid ..... 8
Missouri Plan ..... 14
Appendix: The Fifty States in a Nutshell. ..... 22
Judicial Selection Map Inside Back Cover

# Judicial Elections 

# Judicial Elections 

| State | General Election: <br> Partisan or <br> Nonpartisan | Statewide vs. <br> District Election | Interim Vacancy <br> Selection Method | Retention <br> Method |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Alabama | Partisan | Statewide | Gubernatorial appointment | Reelection |
| Arkansas | Nonpartisan | Statewide | Gubernatorial appointment | Reelection |
| Georgia* | Nonpartisan | Statewide | Gubernatorial appointment | Reelection |
| Idaho* | Nonpartisan | Statewide | Gubernatorial appointment | Reelection |
| Illinois | Partisan | District | State high court appointment | Retention election* |
| Kentucky | Nonpartisan | District | Gubernatorial appointment | Reelection |
| Louisiana | Partisan | District | Special election | Reelection |
| Michigan* | Nonpartisan** | Statewide | Gubernatorial appointment | Reelection |
| Minnesota* | Nonpartisan | Statewide | Gubernatorial appointment | Reelection |
| Mississippi | Nonpartisan | District | Gubernatorial appointment | Reelection |
| Montana | Nonpartisan | Statewide | Gubernatorial appointment | Reelection |
| Nevada | Nonpartisan | Statewide | Gubernatorial appointment | Reelection |
| New Mexico* | Partisan | Statewide | Gubernatorial appointment | Retention election** |
| North Carolina | Nonpartisan | Statewide | Gubernatorial appointment | Reelection |
| North Dakota* | Nonpartisan | Statewide | Gubernatorial appointment | Reelection |
| Ohio | Nonpartisan** | Statewide | Gubernatorial appointment | Reelection |
| Oregon* | Nonpartisan | Statewide | Gubernatorial appointment | Reelection |
| Pennsylvania | Partisan | Statewide | Gubernatorial appointment | Retention election^ |
| Texas* | Partisan | Statewide | Gubernatorial appointment | Reelection |
| Washington | Nonpartisan | Statewide | Gubernatorial appointment | Reelection |
| West Virginia | Partisan | Statewide | Gubernatorial appointment | Reelection |
| Wisconsin | Nonpartisan | Statewide | Gubernatorial appointment | Reelection |
| * |  |  |  |  |

* Some may consider these states to be functionally equivalent to the gubernatorial appointment states because of the frequency with which judges are appointed to fill interim vacancies.

[^0]
## Democratic Appointment*

* Judges are appointed directly by a democratic body, or appointed by the governor with the advice and consent of some democratic body.


## Democratic Appointment

| State | Who Appoints | Judicial Selection Process | Confirming Body | Retention Method |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| California | Governor | - Governor, with input from the Commission on Judicial Nominees Evaluation, nominates candidates who must be confirmed by Commission on Judicial Appointments. | Commission on Judicial Appointments: Chief Justice, Attorney General, and Senior Presiding Justice of the Courts of Appeal. | Retention election at the next gubernatorial election after appointment. |
| Maine | Governor | - Governor, with input from the Select Committee on Judicial Appointments, submits names to joint legislative committee. <br> - Joint legislative committee recommends or denies the nominee with a majority vote. <br> - The recommendation of the joint legislative committee is final unless the senate overrides the committee's position by a two-thirds vote. | Joint legislative committee majority vote or an override two-thirds vote of the senate. | Reappointment by Governor and reappointment by the senate. |
| New Jersey | Governor | - Governor submits nominations to Senate Judiciary Committee. <br> - The Senate Judiciary Committee makes a report with a recommendation to confirm or reject or a report without any recommendation that is presented before the senate. <br> - Majority of the senate (or 21 senators) is required to vote in the affirmative to confirm the nomination. | Majority vote of the senate. | Reappointment by Governor after 7 years, for tenure until the mandatory retirement age of 70 . |
| South Carolina | Legislature | - The general assembly elects Justices from list of nominees from the Judicial Merit Selection Commission, which determines the qualification and fitness of all candidates. <br> o The general assembly can require the Commission to make further nominations. <br> - Justices are elected by a joint public vote by both legislative houses of the general assembly. | Majority joint vote of the general assembly (both legislative houses). | Reelection by legislature. Justices submit papers to the Judicial Merit Selection Commission, which determines if Justices are "qualified," followed by a vote of the general assembly to reelect. |
| Virginia | Legislature | - Candidates are evaluated by the Virginia State Bar Judicial Candidate Evaluation Committee. <br> - Candidates are then nominated by members of either legislative house. <br> - The nomination moves to the respective house's Courts of Justice Committee, which must deem the nominee "qualified." <br> - Justices are elected by a majority of the members elected to each house of the general assembly. | Majority vote in each house of the general assembly (majority in each legislative house). | Reelection by legislature. The courts of justice committees of each house interview candidates who seek reelection. Justices can be reelected by general assembly. |

## Hybrid*

* Judges are appointed by Governor after nomination by a commission and confirmation by a democratic body.


## Connecticut

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

12 members:

- 6 lawyers
o 3 appointed by Governor*
o 3 appointed by
- President Pro Tempore of the Senate
- Majority Leader of the House of Representatives
- Minority Leader of the House of Representatives
- 6 non-lawyers

```
        o 3 appointed by Governor*
        o 3 appointed by
```

- Speaker of the House of Representatives
- Majority Leader of the Senate
- Minority Leader of the Senate
* Of the 6 appointed by Governor, there must be 1 per congressional district and 1 member at-large.

Terms: 3 years (staggered)
Commission submits list of candidates from which Governor must choose one.
Candidate is subject to appointment by the general assembly.
Method of Retention: Renomination and reappointment by Governor and commission


Percentage of Lawyers on the
Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

## Delaware*

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

## 11 members:

- 10 appointed by Governor
o At least 4 lawyers
o At least 4 non-lawyers
- 1 additional lawyer nominated by President of the state bar, who is then appointed by Governor
* Judicial nominating commission established by Executive Order

Terms: 3 years (staggered)
Commission submits a list of at least three qualified persons from which Governor may choose one.
Governor's appointment is subject to consent of the senate.
Method of Retention: Reappointment and reconfirmation


Percentage of Lawyers on the
Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

## Hawaii

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

9 members*:

- 2 lawyers elected by the state bar
- 2 members appointed by Governor
o Only 1 may be a lawyer
- 2 members appointed by Speaker of the House
- 2 members appointed by President of the Senate
- 1 members appointed by Chief Justice
* Only 4 total may be lawyers; at least one member of commission shall be a resident of a county other than Honolulu Terms: 6 years (staggered)
Commission submits a list of at least four but no more than six nominees from which Governor must choose one.
Governor's appointment is subject to consent of the senate.
Method of Retention: Reappointment by commission


Percentage of Lawyers on the
Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

## Maryland ${ }^{*}$

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

17 members:

- 5 lawyers submitted for appointment by President of the state bar
- 12 members appointed by Governor
* Judicial nominating commission established by Executive Order

Terms: 4 years (non-staggered)
Commission submits a list of at least three candidates from which Governor may choose one.
Governor's appointment is subject to advice and consent of the senate.
Method of Retention: Retention election by voters in appellate judicial circuit from which judge was appointed


Percentage of Lawyers on the
Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

## Massachusetts*

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

21 members:

- All appointed by Governor
* Judicial nominating commission established by Executive Order

Terms: 1 year (non-staggered)
Commission submits a list of at least three but no more than six applicants to Governor, from which Governor may choose one.
Governor's appointment is subject to advice and consent of the Governor's Council.
Method of Retention: No retention; mandatory retirement at age 70


Percentage of Lawyers on the Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

## New Hampshire*

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

11 members**:

- All appointed by Governor
o 6 lawyers
o 5 members appointed from public at-large
* Judicial nominating commission established by Executive Order
** Each Executive Council Districts must be represented on Commission
Terms: 3 years maximum (non-staggered)
Commission submits a list of names of qualified persons to Governor from which Governor may choose one
Governor's nominee is subject to approval by the Executive Council.
Method of Retention: No retention; mandatory retirement at age 70


Percentage of Lawyers on the
Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

## New York

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

12 members:

- 4 lawyers
o 2 appointed by Governor
o 2 appointed by Chief Judge
- 4 non-lawyers
o 2 appointed by Governor
o 2 appointed by Chief Judge
- 4 members, 1 appointed by each of the following
o Speaker of the Assembly
o Temporary President of the Senate
o Minority Leader of the Senate
o Minority Leader of the Assembly
Terms: 4 years (staggered)
Commission submits a list of at least three but no more than seven persons well-qualified from which Governor must choose one. Governor's appointment is subject to advice and consent of the senate.
Method of Retention: Commission recommendation, gubernatorial appointment, senate confirmation


Percentage of Lawyers on the Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

## Rhode Island

Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission
9 members:

- 4 appointed by Governor
o 3 lawyers
o 1 non-lawyer
- 5 members, 1 appointed from each of the following, subject to appointment by the Governor
- At least 3 lawyers submitted by Speaker of the House of Representatives
- At least 3 lawyers or non-lawyers submitted by President of the Senate
- 4 non-lawyers submitted jointly by Speaker of the House of Representatives and President of the Senate
- At least 3 non-lawyers submitted by Minority Leader of the House of Representatives
- At least 3 non-lawyers submitted by Minority Leader of the Senate

Terms: 4 years (staggered)
Commission submits a list of at least three but no more than five persons from which Governor must choose one.
Governor's nominee is subject to advice and consent of the senate and advice and consent of the house of representatives.
Method of Retention: No retention; life appointment


Percentage of Lawyers on the Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

## Utah

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

8 members:

- 7 appointed by Governor
o 2 lawyers from a list of 6 lawyers submitted by the state bar
o No more than 4 lawyers
- 1 member appointed by Chief Justice from the Utah Judicial Council to serve as nonvoting member Terms: 4 years (non-staggered)
Commission submits a list of three nominees from which Governor must choose one.
Governor's appointment is subject to senate approval.
Method of Retention: Retention election


Percentage of Lawyers on the Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

## Vermont

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission <br> 11 members:

- 3 lawyers appointed by the state bar
- 2 non-lawyers appointed by Governor
- 3 members of the senate elected by the senate
o Only 1 may be a lawyer
- 3 members of the house of representatives elected by the house of representatives

$$
\text { o Only } 1 \text { may be a lawyer }
$$

Terms: 2 years (non-staggered)
Commission submits a list of nominees from which Governor must choose one.
Governor's appointment is subject to advice and consent of the senate.
Method of Retention: Approval by the general assembly


Percentage of Lawyers on the
Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

## Missouri Plan*

* Judges are appointed by Governor after nomination by a commission


## Alaska

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

7 members:

- 3 lawyers appointed by the state bar
- 3 non-lawyer members appointed by Governor and confirmed by state legislature
- Chief Justice of state high court is ex officio chair

Terms: 6 years (staggered)
Commission submits at least two persons from which Governor must choose one.
Method of Retention: Retention election


## Arizona

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

## 16 members:

- 5 lawyers nominated by Board of Governors of the state bar, appointed by Governor, and confirmed by senate
- 10 non-lawyers appointed by Governor and confirmed by senate
- Chief Justice or designated Associate Justice of state high court serves as chair

Terms: 4 years (staggered)
Commission submits at least three nominees from which Governor must choose one.
Method of Retention: Retention election


Percentage of Lawyers on the
Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

## Colorado

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

16 members:

- 7 lawyers, 1 per congressional district, appointed by majority action of Governor, Attorney General, and Chief Justice
- 7 non-lawyers, 1 per congressional district, appointed by Governor
- 1 additional non-lawyer appointed by Governor
- Chief Justice is ex officio nonvoting chair

Terms: 6 years (staggered)
Commission submits a list of three nominees from which Governor must choose one.
Method of Retention: Retention election


## Florida

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

9 members:

- 5 appointed by Governor
o 2 additional lawyers
o 3 may be non-lawyers
- 4 lawyers recommended by Board of Governors of the state bar


## Terms: 4 years (staggered)

Commission submits a list of at least three but no more than six nominees from which Governor must choose one.
Method of Retention: Retention election


Percentage of Lawyers on the Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

## Indiana

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

7 members:

- 3 lawyers, 1 per court of appeals district, elected by the state bar members in each district
- 3 non-lawyers, 1 per court of appeals district, appointed by Governor
- Chief Justice of state high court is ex officio chair

Terms: 3 years (staggered)
Commission submits three nominees from which Governor must choose one.
Method of Retention: Retention election


Percentage of Lawyers on the Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

## Iowa

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

## 17 members:

- 8 lawyers, 1 per congressional district, elected by resident members of the state bar in each district
- 8 members, 1 per congressional district, appointed by Governor, subject to senate confirmation
- Senior Associate Justice of state high court is ex officio chair

Terms: 6 years (staggered)
Commission submits three nominees from which Governor must choose one.
Method of Retention: Retention election


Percentage of Lawyers on the Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

## Kansas

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

9 members:

- 4 lawyers, 1 per congressional district, elected by members of the state bar in each district
- 1 lawyer elected by lawyers statewide as chair
- 4 non-lawyers, 1 per congressional district, appointed by Governor

Terms: 4 years (staggered)
Commission submits a list of three persons from which Governor must choose one. Method of Retention: Retention election


Percentage of Lawyers on the Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

## Missouri

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

7 members:

- 3 lawyers, 1 per appellate court district, appointed by the state bar
- 3 non-lawyers, 1 per appellate court district, appointed by Governor
- 1 Judge of the Supreme Court selected by the members of that court

Terms: 6 years (staggered)
Commission submits a list of three persons from which Governor must choose one.
Method of Retention: Retention election


Percentage of Lawyers on the
Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

## Nebraska

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

9 members:

- 4 lawyers elected by the state bar
- 4 non-lawyers appointed by Governor
- 1 Judge of the Supreme Court appointed by Governor, serves as chair and has no voting power

Terms: 4 years (staggered)
Commission submits a list of at least two nominees from which Governor must choose one.
Method of Retention: Retention election


## Oklahoma

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

## 15 members:

- 6 lawyers, 1 per congressional district as it existed in 1967, elected by the state bar
- 9 non-lawyers
o 6 non-lawyers, 1 per congressional district as it existed in 1967, appointed by Governor
o 3 non-lawyers to serve as members at-large
- 1 appointed by Senate President Pro Tempore
- 1 appointed by Speaker of the House of Representatives
- 1 selected by other members of the Commission

Terms: 6 years (staggered), 2 years for at-large members
Commission submits a list of three candidates from which Governor must choose one.
Method of Retention: Retention election


Percentage of Lawyers on the
Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

## South Dakota

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

7 members:

- 3 lawyers elected by state bar
- 2 judges of the circuit court, elected by the judicial conference
- 2 non-lawyers appointed by Governor

Terms: 4 years (staggered)
Commission submits a list of at least two persons from which Governor must choose one. Method of Retention: Retention election


Percentage of Lawyers on the Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

## Tennessee

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

## 17 members:

- 8 appointed by Speaker of the Senate
o 2 appointed from each of the state's 3 Grand Divisions
o 2 appointed at-large
o At least 5 lawyers
- 8 appointed by Speaker of the House of Representatives
o 2 appointed from each of the state's 3 Grand Divisions
o 2 appointed at-large
o At least 5 lawyers
- 1 non-lawyer appointed at-large by joint action of Speaker of the Senate and Speaker of the House of Representatives

Terms: 6 years (staggered)
Commission submits a list of at least three nominees from which Governor may choose one.
Method of Retention: Retention election


Percentage of Lawyers on the Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

## Wyoming

## Composition of Judicial Nominating Commission

7 members:

- 3 lawyers elected by the state bar
- 3 non-lawyers appointed by Governor
- Chief Justice of state high court is ex officio chair

Terms: 4 years (staggered)
Commission submits a list of three nominees from which Governor must choose one.
Method of Retention: Retention election


Percentage of Lawyers on the Nominating Commission


Who Selects the Nominating Commissioners?

| State | Name of Highest Court | Judicial Selection Method | Number of Judges | Terms |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Alabama | Supreme Court of Alabama | Election (Partisan) | 9 Justices | 6 years |
| Alaska | Alaska Supreme Court | Missouri Plan | 5 Justices | 3 year minimum initial term, 10 year full term |
| Arizona | Arizona Supreme Court | Missouri Plan | 5 Justices | 2 year minimum initial term, 6 year full term |
| Arkansas | Arkansas Supreme Court | Election (Nonpartisan) | 7 Justices | 8 years |
| California | Supreme Court of California | Democratic Appointment (Gubernatorial) | 7 Justices | 12 years |
| Colorado | Colorado Supreme Court | Missouri Plan (No Role for Bar) | 7 Justices | 2 year minimum initial term, 10 year full term |
| Connecticut | Connecticut Supreme Court | Hybrid | 7 Justices | 8 years |
| Delaware | Delaware Supreme Court | Hybrid | 5 Justices | 12 years |
| Florida | Florida Supreme Court | Missouri Plan | 7 Justices | 1 year minimum initial term, 6 year full term |
| Georgia | Supreme Court of Georgia | Election (Nonpartisan) | 7 Justices | 6 years |
| Hawaii | Supreme Court of Hawaii | Hybrid | 5 Justices | 10 years |
| Idaho | Idaho Supreme Court | Election (Nonpartisan) | 5 Justices | 6 years |
| Illinois | Illinois Supreme Court | Election (Partisan) | 7 Justices | 10 years |
| Indiana | Indiana Supreme Court | Missouri Plan | 5 Justices | 2 year minimum initial term, 10 year full term |
| Iowa | Iowa Supreme Court | Missouri Plan | 7 Justices | 1 year minimum initial term, 8 year full term |
| Kansas | Kansas Supreme Court | Missouri Plan | 7 Justices | 1 year minimum initial term, 6 year full term |
| Kentucky | Supreme Court of Kentucky | Election (Nonpartisan) | 7 Justices | 8 years |
| Louisiana | Louisiana Supreme Court | Election (Partisan) | 7 Justices | 10 years |
| Maine | Maine Supreme Judicial Court | Democratic Appointment (Gubernatorial) | 7 Justices | 7 years |
| Maryland | Court of Appeals of Maryland | Hybrid | 7 Judges | 10 years |
| Massachusetts | Massachusetts Supreme Judicial Court | Hybrid | 7 Justices | Appointment until age 70 |
| Michigan | Michigan Supreme Court | Election (Nonpartisan) | 7 Justices | 8 years |
| Minnesota | Minnesota Supreme Court | Election (Nonpartisan) | 7 Justices | 6 years |
| Mississippi | Mississippi Supreme Court | Election (Nonpartisan) | 9 Justices | 8 years |




[^0]:    ** Nominated in partisan primaries/caucuses
    $+60 \%$ required for retention
    \# 57\% required for retention
    $\wedge$ simple majority required for retention

